Exploring the Voice of Populist Movements in the Employment of Foreign Nationals: A Comparative Study of Botswana and South Africa

Reward Utete[1]; Sheunesu Zhou[1]; Oluwatoyin Ayodele Ajani[2]

[1] Department of Business Management, University of Zululand, South Africa

[2] Department of Languages and Humanities, University of Zululand, South Africa

E-mail: oaajani@gmail.com

Abstract

Labour immigration has been on the rise and has had policy implications for public leaders of relatively stable Southern African Development Corporation (SADC) countries. In this paper, the status of populism and labour immigration in Botswana and South Africa was explored. The primary sources of labour immigration are Zimbabwe and Mozambique. Economic disparities and the disintegration of the socio-economic conditions of the neighbouring countries have been major antecedents for the labour movements of the masses. The study utilised a qualitative method and comparative case study design. The study found that populist movements have much influence on the termination of employment of foreign nationals in Botswana and South Africa as shown by their anti-immigrant attitudes, market protectionism, and close-the-borders protests. As these measures have become inefficient over the years, policies and proposals are recommended in response.

Keywords: Populist Movements; Employment; Foreign Nationals; Policies; Immigrants; Economy

Introduction

Populism is a political movement. According to Beresford, Beardsworth, Findlay, and Alger (2023), populists typically attempt to distinguish between ordinary people and "elites" (typically, the upper classes of society). Wealthy or well-educated persons may be considered elites by populists. The populist movement leaders self-portray the image of the traditional, approachable candidate, anti-elitist, and South African liberator (Forster, 2020). Some take advantage of their ethnic, and native languages that have long been marginalised in mainstream affairs to form populist movements (Waller, Hodge, Holford, Milana & Webb, 2017). Forster (2020) opines that in the Sub-Saharan region, populist movements are associated with xenophobia, ant-expertise, attitudes, and protectionism. The economic

climate of South Africa is becoming volatile which leads to the rise of populist movements in communities and some political parties capitalise on that to garner support from the communities (Israel & Billy, 2019).

The populist movement has enforced organisations to 'put the South African in all consideration' (Nkrumah, 2021; Utete, Zhou & Ajani, 2022). They seek their mandates to be exercised in organisations' employment policies. The manifestos of populist movements contain aspects such as anti-immigrant attitudes, market protectionism, and closing the borders. This vindicates the nationalists who advocate for a poorly connected world and less globalisation. As the pandemic spread across the country, most organisations shut down and hunger hit hard those people that depend on hand-to-mouth earnings leading to the eruptions and mushrooming of the populist movements of anti-lockdown. Although the increase of populist movements take the centre stage during the Covid-19, it can be concluded that the emergence of the majority of populist movements is aligned with the existing economic constraints brought about by Covid-19(Biancalana, Heinisch & Mazzoleni, 2021). When the measures of lockdown were extended over a long time, the long-held positions of populists become legitimatised. The invisible wall put by the coronavirus exacerbates the situation as no travel was allowed and the populist takes advantage to include the vulnerabilities and constraints related to the pandemic of Covid-19 into their playbook. The paper sought to answer the question of how businesses that rely on the international workforce copy and react to a hostile, populism environment.

Economic globalisation over the past decades has come along with the phenomenon of labour immigration (Nkrumah, 2021). Documented immigrants and citizens live under fairly conducive conditions with access to adequate shelter, access to education, electricity, and other amenities (Nshimbi, 2018). The majority of immigrants on the other hand live under desperate conditions that have socio-economic, and psychological ramifications. One of the factors that worsen the socio-economic conditions of immigrants is the need to evade legal apprehension and harassment from authorities of immigrants in general (Ngwenya, 2021). Although some illegal labour finds opportunities in the formal economy, some of the whereabouts of immigrants are shrouded in the informal economy and even illegality (Moyo, 2020). Illegality also interfaces with the fact that illegal immigrant labour tends to be one of the victims of human trafficking and the drug trade (Banda, 2019). It is therefore for this reason that some of the xenophobic views in the host countries of immigrant labour are reinforced through the caricature of drug dealers, organised criminals, and vigilantes (Moyo, 2020).

Since it is difficult to track and monitor the movements of immigrants, leaders in the host countries often propose restrictive measures that negatively impact the well-being of immigrants and condemn them to the underground ecosystem where they have less contact with basic institutions that they require to survive such as home affairs offices, health services, education and economic opportunities (Andrees, 2021). It is also important to note that due to the reactionary approach to immigration in the SADC region, some of the legislation proposed to curtail in-flows of immigrants who are undocumented results in the disenfranchisement of immigrants who meet the criteria of legal immigration.

Literature Review

In terms of Zimbabweans, the most attractive destinations for labour immigration for Zimbabweans are South Africa and Botswana. The connections however have eclipsed economic needs over time because as millions of Zimbabweans have crossed the border since the 1990s, they have built community and especially family ties that they rely on to immigrate across to the south (Achiume & Lat, 2021). However, as the economic downturn in Zimbabwe worsened at the turn of the early 2000s, more pressure built for some able-bodied youths and middle-aged demographics of the population to seek

reprieve from rising inflation, joblessness, a weak economy and concerns over political instability of the country (Moyo, 2021). Most of these immigrants had access to legal immigration passage into South Africa and the few that crossed the border illegally were tolerated chiefly due to the solidarity of the government of the day towards the plight of ordinary people in Zimbabwe and also a culture of cross-border travel that had been inculcated in the mining and agricultural industries of South Africa for decades (Nshimbi & Moyo, 2021; Utete, Zhou & Ajani, 2022).

However, as the 2008 economic and political crises boiled over in Zimbabwe, there was for the first time a record of immigrants travelling to South Africa through a mix of economic refugees and also persons that were fleeing political persecution (Mlambo, 2019; Langalanga, 2019). The reason why this paper discusses this phenomenon in unison although each part has its meaning and implications is that all these events gave birth to the processes of illegality, the government's apathy to control in-flows of people into South Africa and Botswana in part, and also to how failing institutions reinforce inconducive environments for immigrant labour (Moyo, 2020; Mafa & Makhubele, 2021).

The Aspect of Immigration

The nomenclature around labour immigration needs to be clarified. An immigrant can be viewed as a person who enters the jurisdiction of another country with or without being formally processed under the constitutional and legal guidelines that govern the movement of human beings across an international border (Moyo & Nshimbi, 2019). It could also be applied to people that enter a country on authorised and unauthorised points of entry which are considered to violate the laws of a country for instance, penetration of the border fence at the Limpopo border or the use of water sources to evade human visibility to authorities manning the border sites (Mashau & Mangoedi, 2021). However, in South Africa and Botswana, illegal immigration is codified into law and it can lead to an arrest, deportation, and ban from the countries (in the case of South Africa) through the countries' Immigration Acts (Moyo, 2020). Immigrants tend to receive harsh treatment that is not in the writings of the law but because vulnerable communities are often treated with contempt in SADC (Chiroro, 2020).

In deliberating immigration labour, it is also important to consider a discussion of how formerly legal immigrants can transform into the classification of illegal immigrants. Many people who enter the country's border enter with the required immigration documentation but some tend to overstay the validity of their visa documents, and the law automatically classifies these individuals as illegal immigrants. It is important to note that not all of these individuals overstay the welcome of their own volition but sometimes it's due to the inefficiency and ambiguity of regulations at the Department of home affairs that leave many people without the official required documents for immigration. However, Utete, Zhou, and Ajani (2022) posit that when these individuals have received declarative responses from the home office that their stay can neither be extended nor renewed, they can be classified as legal immigrants pending their movement out of the country as soon as they make travel arrangements to exit the country.

The same inefficiency and regulatory ambiguity may apply to asylum seekers who live under the conditions of illegal immigrants pending the processing and communication of feedback on their applications which sometimes may take many years (Mafa et al, 2021). Important to note here that these conditions, from the government authorities, tend to produce and reproduce illegal immigration to some extent in that, some immigrants may choose to be opportunistic about the rigour of the home affairs departments (Banda, 2018) while some might choose to undertake a livelihood in the country seeing that the prospect of accessing required documentation might be low (Matsa, 2020). In the same manner, one may argue that these individuals may not necessarily fit the profile of illegal immigration as they would have communicated their stay with the home offices (Atong, Maya & Odigie, 2019). However, given the legalese of the phenomenon, policymakers and leaders would more likely adopt the moniker of an illegal immigrant (Nakayama, 2018).

This nomenclature is important to clarify as the social temperature in countries such as South Africa becomes ripe with xenophobic sentiments. There exist misguided notions among communities that working- and lower-class immigrants are mainly illegal and even more bizarre, that they are most likely engaged in illegal activities (Magidimisha, 2018). There are also racist caveats to the discourse about immigration as many other nationalities are not questioned about their documentation status (Makhata & Masango, 2021). Their stay is also not questioned as the general public may assume that because they are not black, they may be documented (Matete, 2021). Policymakers in South Africa such as Thabo Mbeki and Mmusi Maimane have opted to label this kind of approach as Afrophobia instead of the more instructive, xenophobia (Vanyoro, 2019). This matters in the discussion because the unverified sentiments of immigration and general pigeonholing can wrongly inform the immigration legislation which has far and wide-reaching consequences for millions of people.

In terms of data availability**,** as discussed earlier, immigrants tend to elude authorities and therefore, this makes it difficult to record accurate data on their whereabouts (Moyo, 2017). In Botswana for instance, recording accurate illegal immigration data is difficult because immigration regulations are not enforced rigorously and between fines and deportations, there are blurred lines on how penalties are applied for illegal immigration (Nshimbi, Moyo & Gumbo, 2018). There is also a dearth of knowledge of the volumes of illegal immigration in Namibia and much of the statistical information about illegal immigration in South Africa is flooded with innuendo and anti-immigrant narratives (Moyo, 2020). This means that most of the quantitative data on illegal immigration can be sourced from the 1990s, which is far gone to producing generalisations in terms of policy and implications in the contemporary context of human migration in SADC Segatti, 2017).

Immigration departments are also under-resourced in this regard as they are unable to adequately mobilise statistical data on the inflows of immigrants thus making it difficult to triangulate data and proffer some comparative analyses of the contemporary data about the phenomenon of illegal immigration in SADC (Crush & Peberdy, 2018). Current estimates by the policymakers in South Africa are that the country could be ranging to over 8 million illegal immigrants, which in the bigger picture of population and human science can be problematic (Mokoena, 2020). The GNI of South Africa is higher than most SADC countries and the standards of living are attractive for immigrants for instance, access to basic amenities, access to informal and formal economic opportunities, primary health services, and opportunities to support immigrant families (Moyo, 2020). Estimates point out that illegal immigrants in the Sub-Saharan region have a volume of up to 50 million and the majority of these are stationed in South Africa.

The South African Situation

The government of South Africa faces unique circumstances in that the country's illegal immigration has grown in unison with the rise in economic activities and the standards of living (Dithebe, 2017). However, coming from a history where the working class was at a disadvantage and failed to equalise the gap between the poor and the rich, the policymakers have a challenge in their hands to ensure that the economic capital and resources of the country prioritise citizens first (Dithebe & Mkhuba, 2018). The immigration regulations have been amended to therefore prioritise the scarce skills that the economy requires and to streamline the influx of mine and farm labour (Crush & Williams, 2018). However, these regulations have been in discord with the dynamics of the hard economy in that, most of the economic opportunities in demand are in the farms and the mining sector (Yesufu, 2021). This added to the labour demand of farm owners and mining companies who require cheap labour from beyond the country's borders.

However, as the country's economy has been slow to progress and the upward socio-economic mobility of South Africans has become more difficult, the demand for farming, building, mining,

manufacturing, retail, and tourism jobs by the locals has also risen (Moyo, 2020). Barriers to entry for the locals are the trust that has been inculcated between business owners and the immigrant communities, and the reluctance of business owners to adhere dutifully to the immigration regulations of the country (Danane, 2022). This has therefore partly given rise to the rhetoric that foreigners (including illegal immigrants) are taking jobs from locals. A study by the Southern African Migration Project (SAMP) indicates that people in sending and receiving countries have very low opinions of illegal immigrants (Ng'andu, 2019). Over 65% of South Africans feel that illegal immigrants should never be granted police protection or rights to social security and legal protection; and almost 90% believe that illegal immigrants should never be granted voting right or freedom of speech (Dithebe & Mkhuba, 2018).

The challenge for the country seems to draw from the fact that immigration laws tend to be ambiguous for many of the stakeholders (Woyo, 2017). The need for migrant labour has been entrenched in the economy of South Africa and business leaders rely much on immigrant labour (Nshimbi & Moyo, 2017). However, as the economy of South Africa has a bleak forecast, illegal immigration has come into the spotlight because the jobs that are occupied by this community are hotly contested by the lower class in the country (Chikowore & Willemse, 2017). Even more, as the middle class begins to shrink, more labour is gravitating downward and needs entry opportunities in restaurants, cleaning, farmland, odd jobs, and home services jobs to fend themselves economically (Mlambo, 2017).

The challenges highlighted above are compounded by the rise in youth unemployment in South Africa. According to Utete, Zhou, and Ajani (2022), many youths including graduates are not active in the economy and one avenue that they might need to use to enter the micro and macro economy are the services jobs and odd jobs (Nshimbi, 2018). This puts much pressure on contested territory which spills over to the socio-cultural challenges of animosity of locals towards foreigners in general. One may ask with these challenges, what is the role of government and the rationale for the authorities' poor response to alleviate these challenges (Danane, 2022). One of the reasons behind unmitigated illegal immigration is the lack of political will from the authorities who are mandated to enforce laws.

The infrastructure on land to confront the illegal penetration of undocumented people tends to be poor and the mechanisms to track illegal immigrants in the country tend to be an arduous undertaking to bear (Ngwenya, 2021). Therefore, law enforcement tends to be sporadic chiefly off political opportunism when communities express anger at foreigners and when authorities seek to victimise foreigners; all of which do not link to the issues of decisively mitigating illegal immigration (Moyo, 2020). The systems for documenting people are also inefficient which means that even when millions are willing to get documented, the access to documentation is low, and law-abiding people are condemned to illegality in the process (Banda, 2019). Therefore, one can look at the South African situation in terms of social class warfare, inefficiencies in implementing laws, and the historical reliance on undocumented immigrant labour for some of the leading industries in the country.

The Botswana Situation

The economy of Botswana, like the South African economic context, also lures much of the illegal immigrant labour. The country's per capita GNI of Botswana increased at an annual average rate of 9% between 2019/2020 and continued rising from US$2,790 to US$3,310 to US$3,430 (World Bank, 2020). Its foreign reserves have also increased annually and they were US$5.9 billion in 2019 (Moyo, 2020). The economy is one major indicator for human movement into foreign countries in Sub-Sahara because people see opportunities for economic stability and some degree of social security (Langalanga, 2019). Many young Africans have recently been migrating which has put a thrust on Gaborone because historically, older men were the ones who mostly immigrated. Recently, youth from Malawi, Zimbabwe, and Mozambique have been immigrating across the SADC border for better economic opportunities. Even more, young women who historically did not move permanently to foreign countries in the SADC

region have also been migrating at a higher rate (Mlambo, 2020). In the 1990s, women used to embark on cross-border trading to feed their families back in their home countries. In the 2000s, young women as well as part of their preceding generation have been migrating and settling in Botswana for longer than they used to in the past (Moyo, 2020; Mafa & Makhubele, 2021). This is also facilitated by the normalisation of breakdowns in the traditional family units as well as the emancipation of women which has freed many to act independently when it comes to making socio-economic decisions.

Immigration laws of Botswana are enforced but they are not stringent. This provides safety for those who are unable to get documentation and those who are willing to pay fines when they are apprehended by authorities (Mafa & Makhubele, 2020). However, Botswana has not answered the question of reoffending which most illegal immigrants commit and they are let off with warnings, recurring fines, bribes in some cases, and deportations that do not carry bans. Largely because of the economic disparity between Botswana and Zimbabwe, Botswana (citizens of Botswana) perceive almost all Zimbabweans in the country are illegal immigrants (Mlambo, 2017). This has contributed largely to frequent police raids in areas suspected to harbour illegal immigrants from Zimbabwe (Andrees, 2021). However, though Zimbabweans bear the brunt of Botswana's anger over the increasing incidence of crime and prostitution in Botswana, the police have often tried to dismiss this perception.

Consequences of Labour Immigration

One of the controversial views on the consequences of immigration is that it threatens the socio-cultural fibre of host countries. While more people are likely to say that illegal immigrants are bad because they take jobs from locals, many speculate that immigrants are the main causes of rampant crime, the dilapidated state of inner cities, the drug epidemic, human trafficking, and sex work in neighborhoods (Mashau & Magoedi, 2021, Andrees, 2021, Banda, 2019). These sentiments are mostly reflected in discourse about Johannesburg in South Africa where illegal immigrants are accused of hijacking buildings, distributing drugs at scale, and committing crimes. It is important however to note that there are no sufficient statistics to establish these correlations (Chiroro, 2020). Policymakers often argue that these statistics are unavailable because illegal immigrants are not on public record but the crime epidemic in South Africa cannot be attributed to illegal migrant labour. Often, the narrative is engaged to strengthen anti-migrant sentiments as locals may not be able to realistically tabulate who commits crimes in communities and the disparities between local and foreign perpetrators (Banda, 2018). The arguments are also often embroiled in class warfare as it is mostly poor people who have entrenched negative attitudes towards migrant labour (Matsa, 2020). However, it cannot be lost that the consequence of immigration is xenophobia. Incompatibilities with local cultures and local communities can be a breeding ground for bloody confrontations as witnessed in the 2008 and 2014 xenophobic attacks in South Africa.

The argument of economic pressure on a few job opportunities has many limitations in application because poor immigrants do not have access to more formalised jobs (Magidimisha, 2018). The odd jobs that poor people fight for with immigrant labour can hardly be considered to be the bedrock of the economy. Rather, due to a stagnant economy and the inability of the South African government to address inequality, illegal immigrant labour has now been used as a vice to explain the economic hardships of the lower class and parts of the population that seek entry-level economic opportunities.

Regional Cooperation

Immigration controls in SADC are often viewed as a political and diplomatic instrument. Some SADC leaders do not view border controls as internal policy measures but as a political embarrassment by their allies in the region (Yesufu, 2021). This, therefore, leads to the disintegrated formulation and implementation of policies in the bloc (Woyo, 2017). It is therefore recommended that SADC not only craft policies but also coordinate in the manner in which policies are implemented as home and host countries have a role to play to facilitate the well-being of immigrants. Home countries can facilitate

enforcement on their side of the borders while host countries can ensure policy clarity that rejuvenates direction for fellow law enforcement in the region.

Theoretical Framework

The study employed the Toulmin model as a guide to its argument (Wentzel, 2016). The Toulmin model delves into the construction of a good argument beginning with a claim. A claim relates to a statement that creates a base for different responses to opposing interpretations or views. Secondly, the model needs the support of the claims by facts or evidence. The evidence or facts are drawn from credible sources, validated theories, and peer-reviewed studies among others. Thirdly, the model requires a warrant to be given. In this context, a warrant refers to the explanation of the data and evidence provided in support of the claim and the reason for their relevance to the claim. Fourth, the model needs qualifications to be given for the presentation of a claim. This involves the deliberate weakening of the claim to the level where it seems 'confidently uncertain'. Weakening the claim improves accuracy and lessens its vulnerability of it to criticism. Finally, the model solicits counterarguments, which tackle circumstances under which an argument may be declared invalid. The counterargument can take the form of challenging the warrant, the evidence, or the claim (Wentzel, 2016).

Method

The study employed the qualitative method, which is widely and increasingly utilised in social science research as confirmed by Adams and Lawrence (2015). Through the qualitative method, the researcher can obtain high-quality results in respect of the research questions of the study. Rich information can be gathered through a qualitative study. The study utilised a small number of cases, hence the qualitative approach is the most suitable due to its focus on complexity and nuance cases. The study utilised a comparative case study design (Bell & Water, 2014). The research design compares and examines the two cases of Botswana and South Africa to answer the research questions. The comparative design focuses on matching and observing the chosen cases and drawing conclusions. The conclusions drawn from the comparisons do not experiment. The key strength of the comparative research design is that it gives the base to make predictions, have classification improvements, and contextualise knowledge through observing the differences and similarities between the cases. In this study, the most-similar and most-different cases were identified. Through examining the cases, common correlations and causes can be identified. In terms of data collection, the desktop reviewing method was used to scoop for journals on the phenomenon. The desktop method was employed to answer the research questions utilising the online indexes, reports and online databases, and published literature.

Populism and Botswana

Due to the increase in the number of qualified but unemployed citizens, Botswana stopped recruiting new foreign teachers (Ndebele, 2021). However, it allowed foreign teachers with existing valid permits to continue working but once they get expired, they cannot be renewed. For jobs that Botswana cannot secure qualified locals, it will continue to hire foreign nationals. The nation of Botswana continues to scarcity of teachers in areas such as commerce, accounting, and economics despite having an improvement in the number of qualified Batswana teachers. About 160 teachers of the 500 local graduates that were still unemployed could teach indigenous language (Mogalakwe, 2008. A crackdown has been registered on immigrant holders of driver's licenses of Public Service Vehicles (PSV). The issuance of licences of PSV to immigrants was withdrawn to have exclusive protection on local jobs. The immigrants have been accused by local drivers of accepting work for a meagre salary led to the arrest of most of them. Most drivers especially from Zimbabwe were arrested by the Department of Road Transport and Safety in Gaborone, the capital city of Botswana. A total stoppage to the issuance of licences to foreign

nationals was ordered by the licensing officers. In the mining sector of Botswana, the decision to withdraw the renewal of work permits of artisans was approved after a group of 31 skilled artisans gave a petition to the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs. The employment of foreigners continues to increase at the expense of qualified local people.

The qualified locals are unemployed whilst the mining sector constitutes the big number of immigrants. The employment process of the foreign nationals in non-skilled areas in the mines of Northern Botswana was prohibited and work permits were revoked as they were perceived as obtained irregularly from the Gaborone office's labour ministry which were supposed to be obtained from the local Francistown office (WageIndicator Foundation, 2022). Foreign employers in the mining sector in Botswana are seen as regularly violating the labour laws of the country by employing foreign nationals. Some foreign employers opt to employ foreign nationals because they do not have adequate time to train inexperienced locals, particularly for artisans' jobs. A few numbers of locals are employed in artisans' jobs which is seen as a gross violation of the Botswana laws and bring much unfairness in the labour market. The government of Botswana continues to promote the citizen empowerment programme by crafting the policy of removing the employment of foreign nationals in the country. However, groups of human rights have warned about the surge in the incidence of xenophobia.

The government, through President Festus Mogae, embarks on the hiring criteria review which prevents strict employment requirements such as experience as it is seen as a way of undermining the abilities to employ qualified local citizens (Shabani, 2019). However, others see citizen empowerment as a scapegoat to shield the tendencies of xenophobia. The incidence of renewal of permits ban included the expulsion of some foreigners, one of them was Rodrick Mukumbira, a Zimbabwean journalist whose permit was revoked without any apparent reason and who was given a week to leave the country. Another one was Prof Kenneth Good, a citizen of Australia, who was expelled by the government after criticising how labour issues are handled within the country. Equitable access to the diverse and nuanced narrative is promoted as the manner of having a highly holistic inclusive journalistic model thereby preventing elite-led, hierarchical system presentation and newsgathering (Rantsimako, 2019).

The Case of South Africa

At the moment of writing this paper, employers in South Africa have been rocked by cases of malpractice which involve hiring foreign nationals with very low salaries at the expense of the locals. These unscrupulous employers enjoy huge profits whilst the majority of people are suffering. This caused the populist movements like Dudula Operation to emerge. Some of these unscrupulous employers have a huge influence on politics and hence become corrupt business elites. These populist movement, Dudula Operation, wants the employment policies to be closely looked at. The rising domestic problems evidenced in the form of high unemployment, poor salaries, poor working conditions, and failures by the government to give basic services to the community, the populist movement takes advantage of these challenges and reaps support base. Millions of young people in different communities have joined populist movements as they show dissatisfaction with the current situation. South Africa has a 35.2% unemployment rate (Statistics South Africa, 2022), and an increase in the cost of living has caused hostile economic and socio-political in various societies that have renewed intense xenophobic attacks on immigrants.

The increment of unscrupulous financial micro-lenders, religious opportunists, and criminals who persist to prey on marginalised and uneducated people has caused a societal change in South Africa which results in the mass losing faith in the mainstream political party (Nkuyane, 2019). Nevertheless, the populist movement campaigns have been centred on political rhetoric while overlooking the extensive policy debates on how the rate of unemployment and poverty can be alleviated. The main populism rhetoric in South Africa held by most citizens is that most foreigners from Africa are taking their jobs and

committing crimes around the country. However, as part of showing international good practices, they portray the xenophobic attacks as activities of criminality from small populist parties that call for foreigners to be expelled from South Africa (Mahlangu & Feketha, 2022). Some manifestos of the populist movement include the creation of protected industrial development that could provide opportunities for employment to South Africans and; develop a corrupt-free and open government and victimisation-free society from the state.

The populist movements support economic emancipation and employee frustrations hence it is characterised by Black Africans' struggles and economic empowerment of Black. In South Africa, populism shifts and incorporate class struggle awareness which is predominantly affected by race and aspirations in respect of black African citizens' empowerment. The populist movement does not only have a support base of predominantly economic peripheral black but it is embraced by the young South African middle class (Bhengu, 2022). Populist movement leaders face racism, particularly between the Black and White South African citizens. In respect of employment, populist movements arise due to unequal representation in corporate boardrooms and poor economic transformation. Mostly, these movements seek to ease black South African poor status. Although there has been substantial economic growth in South Africa, inequitable distribution among social classes still dominates the community. Hence, the need for redistribution of wealth and resources through providing basic reasonable wages and salaries, and promoting employees to top-level positions (Shipalana, 2018). The compensation to employees should be product-linked wages. The populist movements constitute low-income and low-middle classes dispute the policies that are meant to provide massive benefits to the small number of employees at the workplace in South Africa. It is against the background of discontent by the poor South African majority, the populist movement emerged.

The populists appeal to low-income people together with speech delivery associated with charismatic prowess and hence be in a position to have strong ties with marginalised groups. The populist movement leaders hold sessions in which they engage the people in the community about the challenges encountered, particularly the slum dwellers. The supporters of this populism would wear branded protest materials as a way of reinforcing the movement. In South Africa, the populism cases are about the movement's ideologies or conceptualisations, but inspirations entrenched in the minds of the masses that seek to subvert the mainstream leaders or just to show discontent with the current situation (Ngwenyama, 2018). Although poverty and inequality may be the key reasons underlying the thriving and influence of populism in South Africa, retarded growth and progress remain captive as political rhetoric takes the centre stage in which 'us' versus 'them' is seen in the speech. However, the populist elites use professional groups, media, and capital as scapegoats and tools to just their living and gains. The mission of the populist movements is to overturn the status quo, reverting to how things used to work well earlier or reconciling the resources that are required for things to work well in the future (Baloyi, 2020). However, the current populist movement in South Africa is shrouded in overturning the status quo. Unless the surging patterns of inequality in South Africa are dealt with, populist movements will continuously grow. Unless the surging patterns of inequality in South Africa, populist movements will continuously grow. Therefore, this paper investigates whether the Sub-Saharan region has a unique blend of populist movements constituted of a blend of rural dwellers and urban poor people.

Discussion

South Africa and Botswana are major hosts of labour immigration and Zimbabwe and Mozambique are the main primary source of immigration. The rampant populist movements across Sub-Saharan are attributed to big economic discrepancies in the Southern African nations. Although some foreign nationals are employed in the formal industry, the majority of unskilled are involved in aspects that are shrouded in relative secrecy which is usually not aligned with the social and economic of the

receiving countries. Due to the normal level of social and economic development, South Africa has been the highly targeted country in the Sub-Saharan region. Botswana and South Africa are the major attractive nations in Southern Africa. In developing the immigration policy, the South African government invested huge human resources, money, and time.

On the other hand, in terms of immigration policy, Botswana does not have one. The Constitution and Immigration Act guide the actions towards foreign nationals. However, in various issues related to general economic performance, illegal immigrants have been pointed out as scapegoats. The general public, press, and government officials have shown total intolerance of foreign nationals in South Africa (Crush & Peberdy, 2018). A study by the Southern African Migration Project (SAMP) shows that countries on the receiving end do have sufficient knowledge about illegal migrants. About 90% feel that freedom of speech should be afforded to immigrants. In addition, about 65% of South Africans believe that police protection, legal protection, and social security should not be given to immigrants. There are severe negative implications of not controlling illegal immigration in the South African economy. Normally, unskilled and semi-skilled illegal foreign nationals compete for work with low classes of the economically active population of the host country. Preference for employment is given to illegal immigrants by unscrupulous employers who maximise profits through cheap labour(Singh, 2021). Insurance benefits and medical aid are forfeited to illegal foreign nationals by unscrupulous employers. Unscrupulous employers reduce the risk of conflicts with labour unions. The practice of illegal foreign nationals is common in South Africa and Botswana. This is usually witnessed in the construction, domestic, and hospitality industries (Insights, 2020). In Botswana, employers are regularly warned to desist from hiring illegal foreigners by politicians and government officials.

Both nations, Botswana and South Africa, encounter harsh realities as the migration traffic in Southern Africa is directed at them. Foreign nationals have been banned from opening small businesses in most townships by the provincial government of Gauteng. Although both Botswana and South African economies are diversified, the mining sector is the driving force behind the growth of Botswana. Whereas in South Africa, the whole and retail sectors contribute much to the fiscal reserves through value-added tax. The consumption of basic commodities has surged since the year 2005. However, during the 2008-2009 economic meltdown, the general economic growth of both countries went down. The power outages that were chiefly caused by plant challenges negatively affect the economy of South Africa. In addition, the mining unrest also deepened the economic plunge in South Africa. The general reduction in demand for diamonds in Botswana is caused by the shrinkage of the industrial industry after the meltdown of the global economies.

In 2015, there were fierce attacks of xenophobia after Goodwill Zwelithini, the Zulu king declared that immigrants must return to their home countries. Many victims of the incident went to Botswana. Due to the Industrial Development Act of 2019 and its Regulations of 2020, foreign-owned businesses are operating under threat. The law seeks to reserve certain businesses for local citizens and any breach of this law results in prosecution. Ministry of Investment, Trade, and Industry, on 3 November 2021, indicated that furniture, confectionery, and bread production are part of the 21 protected lists of business crafts. Most professionals in Zimbabwe, Malawi, and Mozambique move to South Africa and Botswana for better income. The desire for better opportunities and life remains the migration key driver according to a UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) on Main Intra-African Migration Routes. South Africa deported about 18 000 Zimbabweans from March to June 2021. Being the largest economy in the Sub-Saharan region, South Africa remains a destination of choice for many people from other nations.

One of the most efficient responses to controlling the in-flows of immigrants is the enforcement of immigration laws (Banda, 2019). The laws as they are written for many SADC countries are not efficiently enforced. Apart from producing immigrants by making illegal travel across borders possible,

the poor implementation of immigration laws reproduces immigration through the inefficiency with which the processes of legal migration for SADC citizens are handled (Andrees, 2021). This is compounded by ambiguous regulations such as the recurring banning and unbanning of the Zimbabwe Special Dispensation Permits which place Zimbabwean migrants in a precarious position after every two years. Whenever the leadership of the Department of Home Affairs changes, there are policy shifts that inspire uncertainty (Matete, 2021). It is therefore recommended that immigration laws need to be implemented earnestly and humanely taking careful consideration of how existing laws can strategically serve in undermining immigration.

Assuming that the majority of immigration in southern Africa involves a border crossing, it is recommended that the budget for immigration control be increased substantially, taking into account the increased number of patrol officers covering land and sea borders and maximisation of efficiency and accountability (Chikowore & Willemse, 2017). Applicants for refugee status should not be allowed to work until their applications have been processed and they have been awarded legal residence in the country. Unscrupulous employers should be sanctioned heavily where it was established that they employed an illegal immigrant.

Conclusion

The nationalism sentiments from the populist movements which is centred on prioritising South Africans. These policies are instituted at the expense of the foreign national. However, there is a strong need for cooperation to avoid the sense of panic, as well as the adverse implications related to the virus. Cooperation can challenge the populist movement because it enforces a global community, established institutions, social cohesion, and consensus. Authorities in Botswana and South Africa tend to be overwhelmed and, in many cases, immigration officials are under-equipped to respond to emerging immigration trends. However, the rise of populist movements negatively affects the investor-friendliness of the environment, hence adversely affecting foreign direct investment. The diamond industry is Botswana's economic engine.

References

Achiume, E. T., & Last, T. (2021). Decolonial Regionalism: Reorienting Southern African Migration Policy. *TWAIL Rev.*, *2*, 1.

Adams, K.A. & Lawrence, E.A. (2015). *Research methods, statistics, and applications*. London: Sage publications.

Andrees, B. (2021). Regulating the Business of Labour Migration Intermediaries.

Banda, H. C. C. (2018). Migration, economy, and politics: unprecedented increase in informal labour migration from northern Malawi to South Africa in the 1990s. *African Renaissance*, 15(4): 53-74.

Banda, H. C. C. (2019). The Dynamics of Labour Migration from Northern Malawi to South Africa since 1974.

Bell, J. and Water, S. (2014). *Doing your research project: A guide for first-time researchers*. 6th ed. Berkshire: McGraw-Hill Education.

Beresford, A., Beardsworth, N., Findlay, K., & Alger, S. (2023). Conceptualising the emancipatory potential of populism: A typology and analysis. *Political Geography*, *102*, 102808.

Bhengu, C. (2022, January 19). What do you think of Malema's decision to assess the nationality of workers? TimesLive. March 22, 2022, from https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-01-19-poll-what-do-you-think-of-malemas-decision-to-assess-the-nationality-of-workers/.

Biancalana, C., Heinisch, R., & Mazzoleni, O. (2021). *Populism facing the coronavirus outbreak. In Political Populism*. Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft: mbH & Co. KG publishers.

Bryman, A. & Bell, E. (2015). *Business research methods*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Chiroro, B. (2020). Building Climate Resilience Through Effective, Gender-Sensitive Migration Policy in the SADC Region.

Crush, J., & Peberdy, S. (2018). Criminal tendencies: Immigrants and illegality in South Africa.

Crush, J., & Williams, V. (2018). Making up the numbers: Measuring "illegal immigration" to South Africa.

Danane, Z. J. (2022). Integrated Border Management as a Vector to Combat Illegal Immigration in Mozambique. *Problems of Management in the 21st Century*, *16*(2), 74-86.

Dithebe, M. E. V. (2017). Illegal immigration and weak border controls in South Africa.

Dithebe, M. V. E., & Mukhuba, T. T. (2018). Illegal immigration and weak border control as impediments to development in Africa: a critical analysis of South Africa's borders. *Journal of Gender, Information, and Development in Africa (JGIDA)*, 7(2): 139-158.

Dithebe, M. V. E., & Mukhuba, T. T. (2018). Illegal immigration and the challenge of border control in South Africa. *African Renaissance*, 15(2): 127-147.

Forster, D. A. (2020). State Theology and Political Populism? A Kairos Critique of Religious Populism in South Africa. *Journal of Church and State*, *62*(2), 316-333.

IndustriALL. (2014, March 20). Not so sparkly conditions in Botswana diamond polishing. March 20, 2022. https://www.industriall-union.org/not-so-sparkly-conditions-in-botswana-diamond-polishing.

Insights. (2020, March 3). South Africa: New Bill to Introduce Quotas for Foreign Workers. May 20, 2021, from https://www.fragomen.com/insights/south-africa-new-bill-to-introduce-quotas-for-foreign-workers.html.

Israel, R. & Billy, A. (2019). The emergence and evolution of populism in Sub-Saharan Africa: party politics and personalities. *International journal of political studies*, 5(2): 77-91.

Klaveren, M., Kea, T., Hughie-Williams, M. & Nuria, R.M. (2009). An overview of women's work and employment in Botswana. - rev. ed. AIAS working papers.

Langalanga, A. (2019). A Tale of Two Continents: Comparing Migration Experiences in South Africa and Germany.

Mafa, P., & Makhubele, J. (2021). Determinants of unfair labour practices on African migrant labourers employed in selected labour sectors in South Africa. *Technium Soc. Sci. J.*, *22*, 700.

Mafa, P., Makhubele, C. J., Matlakala, K. F., Baloyi, V. T., Rabotata, E. N., Masilo, T. D., ... & Mabasa, A. M. (2021). South African Natives' conduct towards illegal Migrants: a Human Rights Approach. *e-BANGI*, 18(7): 282-292.

Magidimisha, H. H. (2018). Gender, migration, and crisis in southern Africa: Contestations and tensions in the informal spaces and 'illegal labour 'market. *Crisis, Identity, and Migration in Post-Colonial Southern Africa*, 75-88.

Mahlangu, I. & Feketha, S. (2022, January 20). Julius Malema's restaurant visit causes a stir. Sowetan Live. March 20, 2022, from https://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-01-20-julius-malemas-restaurant-visit-causes-a-stir/.

Makhata, M. B., & Masango, M. J. (2021). Illegal migrant Basotho women in South Africa: Exposure to vulnerability in domestic services. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, 77(2): 8.

Mashau, T. D., & Mangoedi, L. (2021). From a pit to a palace: Deconstructing the economics and politics of labour migration in the City of Tshwane through the lenses of Genesis 41: 41–57. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, 77(4).

Matete, P. (2021). Optimising the legal regulation of circular labour migration between South Africa, Lesotho, and Zimbabwe.

Matsa, W. (2020). Background to the Nature of International Migration in the African Continent and Zimbabwe. *Marginality, Migration, and Education*, 1-10.

Maunganidze, O. A., & Formica, J. (2018). Freedom of movement in Southern Africa: a SADC (pipe) dream? *ISS Southern Africa Report*, 18(17): 1-24.

Mlambo, V. H. (2017). Cross-border migration in the Southern African Development Community (SADC): Benefits, problems, and future prospects. *Journal of Social and Development Sciences*, 8(4): 42-56.

Mlambo, V. H. (2020). Consolidating regional integration through a free movement protocol: the quest for collective development in the SADC. *African Journal of Governance & Development*, 9(2): 455-471.

Mogalakwe, M. (2008). The making of a foreign "labour aristocracy" in Botswana. *Employee Relations*, 30(4): 422-435. https://doi.org/10.1108/01425450810879385.

Mokoena, E. (2020). The role of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) in promoting democracy and good governance in Zimbabwe.

Moyo, I. (2017). Zimbabwean cross-border traders in Botswana and South Africa: Perspectives on SADC regional integration. *Migration, Cross-Border Trade, and Development in Africa*, 43-62.

Moyo, I. (2020). African Informal Migrant Traders in Johannesburg: Experiences on the Ground and Implications on Human Mobility in the SADC. *Migration Conundrums, Regional Integration, and Development*, 213-225.

Moyo, I. (2020). Migration and the spatial mobility of borders in the Southern African region. *Borders, Mobility, Regional Integration and Development*, 113-124.

Moyo, I. (2020). On borders and the liminality of undocumented Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa. *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies*, 18(1): 60-74.

Moyo, I. (2020). On decolonising borders and regional integration in the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region. *Social Sciences*, 9(4): 32.

Moyo, I., & Nshimbi, C. C. (2019). Border practices at Beitbridge border and Johannesburg Inner City: Implications for the SADC regional integration project. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 54(3): 309-330.

Nakayama, Y. (2018). Multilateral migration governance in SADC countries. *African Studies Center–Tokyo University of Foreign Studies, Japan. Working Papers*, 29-43.

Ndebele, L. (2021, Nov 09). Botswana moves to restrict business activities for foreigners. News24. Mar 26, 2022, from https://www.news24.com/news24/africa/news/botswana-moves-to-restrict-business-activities-for-foreigners-20211109.

Ng'andu, P. (2019). Challenges of Combating Illegal Immigration as Cross Border Crime Among Southern Africa Development Community (SADC) Member States: Case Study of Zambia. *globalization*, *74*.

Ngwenya, M. B. (2021). The integration of international migration: a comparative study of South Africa and Australia.

Ngwenyama, J. (2018, April 7). WATCH: EFF shows solidarity with Shoprite workers, bad service at the hospital. Kempton Express. March 22, 2022, from https://kemptonexpress.co.za/270359/eff-fights-corruption-at-tembisa-hospital-and-shoprite/.

Nkrumah, B. (2021). Political opportunism: Populism as a new political tactic in South Africa. In *Africa's radicalisms and conservatisms* (pp. 117-140). Brill.

Nshimbi, C. C. (2018). Issues in African informality-what is the relevance for regional or continental integration? *Africa Insight*, 48(1): 41-61.

Nshimbi, C. C., & Moyo, I. (2017). History, Trends, and Dynamics of Cross-Border Movements and Trade in the SADC Region. *Migration, Cross-Border Trade, and Development in Africa*, 1-13.

Nshimbi, C. C., & Moyo, I. (2018). Informal immigrant traders in Johannesburg: The scorned cornerstone in the Southern African development community integration project. *Africa Now!* 387-413.

Nshimbi, C. C., Moyo, I., & Gumbo, T. (2018). Between neoliberal orthodoxy and securitisation: Prospects and challenges for a borderless southern African community. *Crisis, Identity, and Migration in Post-Colonial Southern Africa*, 167-186.

Rantsimako, S. (2019, April 18). Gov't castigated over poor working conditions. March 23, 2022. https://www.thegazette.news/news/govt-castigated-over-poor-working-conditions/.

Segatti, A. (2017). The Southern African Development Community: a walk away from the free movement of persons? *Migration, Free Movement and Regional Integration*, 47.

Shabani, T. (2019, May 2019). Botswana: BTU Leader Decries Low Wages, Corruption. Daily News. March 26, 2022, from https://allafrica.com/stories/201905020140.html.

Shipalana, T. (2018, February 28) TZANEEN: EFF march against Van Velden and Mopani municipal manager. Herald. March 22, 2022, from https://letabaherald.co.za/49948/tzaneen-eff-march-van-velden-mopani-municipal-manager/February 28, 2018.

Singh, O. (2021, December 03). N3 truck protest follows government's 'failure' to report back on employment of foreign nationals. May 18, 2021, from https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2021-12-03-n3-truck-protest-follows-governments-failure-to-report-back-on-employment-of-foreign-nationals/.

Statistics South Africa. (2022, June 1). South African population. March 18, 2022, from http://www.statssa.gov.za/?m=2020.

Unaludo, S. (2019). Botswana-South Africa economic relations: a history, 1966-2014. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/339827743_BOTSWANA-SOUTH_AFRICA_ECONOMIC_RELATIONS_A_HISTORY_1966-2014/citation/download.

Vanyoro, K. P. (2019). Regularising labour migration of Zimbabwean domestic workers in South Africa.

WageIndicator Foundation. (2022, January 5). Minimum wage – Botswana. March 25, 2022, from https://wageindicator.org/salary/minimum-wage/botswana.

Waller, R., Hodge, S., Holford, J., Milana, M & Webb, S. (2017). Political populism and adult education. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 36 (4), 383-386.

Wentzel, A. 2016. Intermediate Research Skills 2. Colombia [Online]. Available: https://www.academia.edu/21959160/2._Intermediate_Research_Skills_Workshop_2_Argumentative_writing_2016_ [2019, April 01].

Woyo, E. (2017). Visa policies and visa openness scores in SADC–an exclusion element of tourism development in Southern Africa: a critical interjection. *Atna Journal of Tourism Studies*, 12(2): 67-83.

Yesufu, S. (2021). Harmonising Road Transport Legislation in the SADC Region for Crime Prevention. *Insight on Africa*, 13(1): 28-55.

Copyrights